

Notice of Allowability

Application No.

10/028,228

Applicant(s)

PARKINSON ET AL.

Examiner

James S. Wozniak

Art Unit

2626

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address--

All claims being allowable, PROSECUTION ON THE MERITS IS (OR REMAINS) CLOSED in this application. If not included herewith (or previously mailed), a Notice of Allowance (PTOL-85) or other appropriate communication will be mailed in due course. **THIS NOTICE OF ALLOWABILITY IS NOT A GRANT OF PATENT RIGHTS.** This application is subject to withdrawal from issue at the initiative of the Office or upon petition by the applicant. See 37 CFR 1.313 and MPEP 1308.

1. ☒ This communication is responsive to the supplemental amendment after final filed on 5/31/06.
2. ☒ The allowed claim(s) is/are 1,3,5-7,10-13 and 16 (now claims 1-10).
3. ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
- a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some* c) ☐ None of the:
- ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
 - ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. _____.
 - ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this national stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

* Certified copies not received: _____.

Applicant has THREE MONTHS FROM THE "MAILING DATE" of this communication to file a reply complying with the requirements noted below. Failure to timely comply will result in ABANDONMENT of this application.

THIS THREE-MONTH PERIOD IS NOT EXTENDABLE.

4. ☐ A SUBSTITUTE OATH OR DECLARATION must be submitted. Note the attached EXAMINER'S AMENDMENT or NOTICE OF INFORMAL PATENT APPLICATION (PTO-152) which gives reason(s) why the oath or declaration is deficient.
5. ☐ CORRECTED DRAWINGS (as "replacement sheets") must be submitted.
- (a) ☐ including changes required by the Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948) attached
- 1) ☐ hereto or 2) ☐ to Paper No./Mail Date _____.
- (b) ☐ including changes required by the attached Examiner's Amendment / Comment or in the Office action of Paper No./Mail Date _____.
- Identifying indicia such as the application number (see 37 CFR 1.84(c)) should be written on the drawings in the front (not the back) of each sheet. Replacement sheet(s) should be labeled as such in the header according to 37 CFR 1.121(d).
6. ☐ DEPOSIT OF and/or INFORMATION about the deposit of BIOLOGICAL MATERIAL must be submitted. Note the attached Examiner's comment regarding REQUIREMENT FOR THE DEPOSIT OF BIOLOGICAL MATERIAL.

Attachment(s)

- | | |
|---|---|
| 1. <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of References Cited (PTO-892) | 5. <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Informal Patent Application (PTO-152) |
| 2. <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948) | 6. <input type="checkbox"/> Interview Summary (PTO-413),
Paper No./Mail Date _____ |
| 3. <input type="checkbox"/> Information Disclosure Statements (PTO-1449 or PTO/SB/08),
Paper No./Mail Date _____ | 7. <input type="checkbox"/> Examiner's Amendment/Comment |
| 4. <input type="checkbox"/> Examiner's Comment Regarding Requirement for Deposit
of Biological Material | 8. <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Examiner's Statement of Reasons for Allowance |
| | 9. <input type="checkbox"/> Other _____ |

DETAILED ACTION

Response to Amendment

1. In response to the advisory action from 5/23/2006, the applicant has submitted an supplemental amendment after final, filed 5/31/2006, canceling claims 37-49 and requesting reconsideration of claims containing previously indicated allowable subject matter (*Amendment, Page 6*). The applicant's request has been fully considered, and claims 1, 3, 5-7, 10-13, and 16 are allowable over the prior art of record for the below given reasons.

Allowable Subject Matter

2. **Claims 1, 3, 5-7, 10-13, 16** are allowable over the prior art of record.

3. The following is an examiner's statement of reasons for allowance:

With respect to **Claim 1**, the prior art of record fails to fairly teach or explicitly suggest an attribute list having a hierarchy related to a hierarchy of clauses in an input text that is used to construct a sentence argument structure by filling a gap in a linguistic relationship between a token and a segment of text (clause) in combination with the additional subject matter recited in claim 1 including identifying a syntactic rule for combining the text segment and the related token, finding a licensing element in the text segment related to the token and adding the location of the element to the attribute list, and constructing a logical form based in part on the generated

attribute list. Although Cardie et al (*"A Cognitively Plausible Approach to Understanding Complex Syntax," 1991*) teaches a lexically indexed control kernel having a list of syntactic attributes (Fig. 4), the list taught by Cardie has no particular order, and therefore, no order that is based upon a hierarchy of clauses in an input text.

Other related prior art:

Although Jensen (*U.S. Patent: 5,146, 406*) teaches a system for determining a long distance relationship between separated elements within a sentence (Col. 9, Line 36- Col. 12, Line 16) and notes the importance of ordered procedures when determining a long-distance relation to a clause, Jensen does not teach ordering syntactic attributes or that such an ordering is based upon a hierarchy of clauses in an input text.

Claims 3, 5-7, 10-13, and 16 further limit an allowable independent claim, and thus, are also allowable over the prior art of record.

Any comments considered necessary by applicant must be submitted no later than the payment of the issue fee and, to avoid processing delays, should preferably accompany the issue fee. Such submissions should be clearly labeled "Comments on Statement of Reasons for Allowance."

Conclusion

4. Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to James S. Wozniak whose telephone number is (571) 272-7632. The examiner can normally be reached on M-Th, 7:30-5:00, F, 7:30-4, Off Alternate Fridays.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, David Hudspeth can be reached at (571) 272-7843. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free).

James S. Wozniak
6/5/2006


DAVID HUDSPETH
SUPERVISORY PATENT EXAMINER
TECHNOLOGY CENTER 2600